Reviewer's report

Title: Platelet-Rich Plasma vs Hyaluronic Acid to treat knee degenerative pathology: study design and preliminary results of a randomized controlled trial.

Version: 1 Date: 18 October 2012

Reviewer: Jae-Do Kim

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written paper and interesting report on PRP vs Hyaluronic acid to treat osteoarthritis of knee. I feel the article has quite value however I have two questions.

1. In the section of Materials and Methods, there is the information about the interval of PRP injection which performed weekly. However, in your previous article, you suggested that PRP was injected at intervals of three weeks. Why did the interval of PRP injection change? Do you have any idea for changing the interval?

2. It states that “The unit of PRP was divided into 4 small units of 5ml each. One unit was sent to the laboratory for analysis of platelet concentration and for a quality test.” As I know, several growth factors such as IGF, PDGH, FGF is no less important than Platelet itself. In the Results section, the result related to platelet cell count is described. However, there is no information related to the count and any sort of growth factors. Do you have any results about this information?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.