Reviewer's report

Title: No red cell alloimmunization or change of clinical outcome after using fresh frozen cancellous allograft bone for acetabular reconstruction in revision hip arthroplasty: a follow up study

Version: 2 Date: 17 July 2012

Reviewer: Charles Ayekoloye

Reviewer's report:

1. Well defined important clinical question. Revision surgery is going to continue increasing and allograft use will increase. It is therefore important to know all aspect of use of fres frozen allograft including the risk of alloimmunization

2. This is not the best method for answering this question. The best method in my view is a prospective randomised assessor blinded study. This is especially important as there are papers of similar quality showing that Rh isoimmunization may have occurred following fresh frozen allografting of acetabular defect.

It is incumbent on others to show with a well designed study that such outcome is very rare or non existent.

The firm conclusions made should not be made given the significant methodological flaw in methods chosen.

3. Sound data for the study type

4. yes

5. No. Failure to detect any alloimmunization may be because the numbers are too small.

6.No

7. Yes

8. Yes

9. Yes

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare I have no competing interest