Reviewer's report

Title: Anterior cruciate ligament (ACL) reconstruction with quadriceps tendon autograft and press-fit fixation using an anteromedial portal technique

Version: 2 Date: 4 March 2012

Reviewer: Harukazu Tohyama

Reviewer's report:

Background
Page 3: “More recently, several authors have favored press-fit fixation of the graft with a more biological approach avoiding screw fixation and the use of implants. To date all press fit techniques for ACL reconstruction using a quadriceps tendon graft have used a transtibial single incision technique.” The authors should refer the studies about clinical experience of press-fit fixation of a quadriceps tendon graft, e.g., Paessler HH, Mastrokalos DS., Orthop Clin North Am. 2003 Jan;34(1):49-64.

Method
Page 7: “All patients followed a standardized rehabilitation protocol with partial weight bearing for three weeks.” The description of the authors’ rehabilitation protocol was not sufficient. The authors should detail their protocol, e.g. application of braces, ROM exercise, the periods when they allow the patients to run and participate to sports activities.

Results
Page 8: The authors’ evaluation of their technique is not enough for publication. The authors should report their preliminary outcomes of their technique, even if their primary aim is to introduce their technique. They should report the operation time, results on Lachman test, pivot-shift test, side-to-side difference of KT value, ROM, and PF-related symptoms (kneeling pain, crepitation of the patella…) at their one-year follow-up.

Discussion
Page 9: “Press-fit fixation of a bone block on the femoral side provides sufficient strength and assures a perfect tendon to bone junction, thus helping graft incorporation and early graft function [8].” The authors should discuss more details about biomechanical strength. How much is the strength of femur graft complex with press-fit fixation? Is the strength of femur graft complex with press-fit fixation stronger than those with other techniques?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.