Reviewer's report

Title: Prevalence of hip dislocation in regions with and without a surveillance programme: a cross sectional study in Sweden and Norway

Version: 1 Date: 19 October 2011

Reviewer: Marek Jozwiak

Reviewer's report:


Excellent paper highlighting the advantages desired goals of hip surveillance program in comparison with the population of cerebral palsy children under regular care system. The authors present a very interesting observations which strongly contributed with common clinical problem of hip joint displacement in cerebral palsy population and the most promising method of its preventing. On the examples of two cohort groups of patients authors presented the prevalence of hip dislocation on the basis of cross-sectional study performed in seven Norwegian counties and one Swedish healthcare region. The methodological quality of the paper is very high and therefore the conclusions are really supported by the obtained data. Despite the lack of use of randomization, because of ethical point of view, described statistics appear to be optimal for provided data analysis. The fact of 5.3% prevalence of hip dislocation observed in cerebral palsy children in the regular care group in contrast with 0.7% prevalence hip joint dislocations in group of cerebral palsy children monitored with surveillance system is a strong and important support of systematic radiographic and clinical examination performed carried in the course of surveillances program.

There are only some minor points from my side:
1. Abstract: Not sure this methodological design can define both groups of patients in a clear way
2. Results: it is not clear for me how many orthopedics surgeries underwent each hip joint with total dislocation observed during the last follow-up.
3. Discussion: page 13 line 9 - there is: --- children with GMFCS III – IV…. should be changed on " children with GMFCS III – V

I strongly support accepting this paper to publication in BioMedCentral Journal. Thanks for this work.