Reviewer's report

Title: Size and Position of the Healthy Meniscus, and its Correlation with Sex, Height, Weight, Bone Size, and Age - a cross-sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 6 May 2011

Reviewer: Richard Souza

Reviewer's report:

Excellent manuscript. A very careful analysis of the meniscal properties was done and is very well written.

I have no Major Compulsory Revisions.

VERY Minor Essential Revisions:

1) Abstract: Results, last sentence - It may be valuable to indicate that the medial meniscus extrusion is non-normalized, as given the sex differences noted previously, a normalization might be expected. I do realize that the females were greater than males, even without normalization, but given the previous finding, it may better just to clarify.

2) Materials and Methods: Page 5, line 3 - Please add units to BMI data.

3) Materials and Methods: Page 5, line 13 - Please write out ACdAB as is done in the list of abbreviations page. Without this detailed definition, it is hard for the reader to understand how ACdAB is somehow an abbreviation of tibial plateau area.

4) Discussion: Page 10, line 20 - change "relatively" to "relative".

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests