Reviewer’s report

Title: Trochanteric osteotomy versus posterolateral approach Function the first year post surgery

Version: 3 Date: 12 January 2011

Reviewer: Brian McGrory

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for your responses.

There need to be two further changes prior to publication

First, without a power analysis, the authors should acknowledge that the study is underpowered. This could be placed in the section of the Discussion outlining weaknesses.

Next, the conclusions do not really follow the results of the paper. This must be rectified.

Example 1-the abstract:
Method: This prospective study examines differences in rehabilitation between posterolateral and trochanteric approach UP TO one year post-surgery using questionnaires(WOMAC, SF-36, HHS) and functional tests (walking, climbing stairs, rising from sitting, and strength tests). Of the 109 patients 24 had a trochanteric osteotomy: the selected approach was based on the surgeon’s preference. The trochanteric osteotomy group included more patients with developmental dysplasia of the hip.

Results: Data from the questionnaires showed no significant differences between the two groups at 3, 6 and 12-months follow-up. At 3-months follow-up patients in the trochanteric osteotomy group scored lower on the functional tests. This difference had disappeared at 6 and 12-months follow-up, except for abduction force which remained lower in the trochanteric osteotomy group. IN THE GROUP OF PATIENTS THAT HAD A NON-UNION OF THE OSTEOTOMY, ABDUCTION FORCE WAS SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER.

Conclusion: For simple hip arthroplasty an approach without osteotomy seems a logical choice. In more difficult cases, one should not hesitate to perform an osteotomy as the functional results at 6-12 months post-surgery are comparable to the posterolateral approach IF UNION IS OBTAINED.

EXAMPLE 2-Conclusion
In simple primary or revision THA it seems logical to choose the approach with faster rehabilitation, less blood loss and faster, more frequent dismissals to home. Although TO seems to be disappearing from our operating theatres, in experienced hands TO MAY GIVE gives good functional results 6-12 months after surgery IF TROCHANTERIC UNION IS ACHIEVED and therefore should not be discarded.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I DECLARE THAT I HAVE NO COMPETING INTERESTS