Reviewer's report

Title: Mortality and cause of death in hip fracture patients aged 65 or older - a population-based study

Version: 2 Date: 22 June 2010

Reviewer: Marc-Antoine Krieg

Reviewer's report:

In this manuscript, the authors aimed to assess the excess of mortality after a hip fracture in elderly men and women from Western Finland compared to the general population. They also planned to analyze causes of death comparing sex, fracture types, and hip fracture subjects with the general Finnish population. Even if many data and review have been published about mortality after a hip fracture, this topic is of importance as it remains under-recognized for patients and politics in many countries. The global long term excess of mortality compared to the general population showed in this study is very impressive. However, there are several aspects that have to be improved to reach a sufficient level of interest.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Globally, the text has to be extensively reviewed by the authors in order to improve its style, to avoid repetitions. It also needs to be reviewed by an English spoken person. This is of major importance to make it more attractive for readers.

It is difficult to know if the choice to consider only the "ultimate" cause of death per subject is correct. Indeed, it is well known that hip fracture patients usually have co-morbidities which could influence the risk to die. For example, for a patient with dementia, the cause of death could be a pulmonary disease or a neoplasm. Therefore, the prevention message remains uncompleted. And for a prevention message, the authors must be more precise than for example pulmonary diseases.

In the last paragraph of the discussion, the authors have mentioned the importance of nutritional intervention. This is probably one of the major messages they could give (muscle impairment would have been another topic), but malnutrition or frailty have not been investigated in this study. From a clinical point of view, it would have been important to consider the patient within its global medical conditions for prevention counseling, not only the ultimate cause of death.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests