Reviewer's report

Title: Bone mineral density of the proximal femur after hip resurfacing arthroplasty: 1-year follow-up study.

Version: 3 Date: 18 August 2010

Reviewer: Amar Ranawat

Reviewer's report:

BMC Musculoskeletal Disorders (MS: 1427742940418709)
Bone mineral density of the proximal femur after hip resurfacing arthroplasty: 1-year follow-up study.

This is an interesting study investigating the bone mineral density of the proximal femur after hip resurfacing arthroplasty at two days, 3, 6 and 12 months postoperatively. I recommend publication with minor essential revisions:

1. ABSTRACT: Background as written makes no mention of HRA.
2. BACKGROUND: It should focus more on bone remodeling and justifying the importance of quantifying the bone density. There is no mention of neck resorption/thinning. The opening statements are too strongly worded. There is no consensus that HRA is THE primary treatment option in younger, active patients. There is no evidence that HRA eliminates stress shielding and osteolysis.
3. In methods, there is a typo, BMI>27 and >30 (not less or <)
4. The discussion should start with re-examining the question/hypothesis.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests