Reviewer's report

Title: On the contributions of lean mass and fat mass to bone mineral density: A study in postmenopausal women

Version: 1 Date: 4 January 2010

Reviewer: Tsutomu Douchi

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting manuscript. Authors concluded that in postmenopausal women, both lean mass and fat mass are important BMD determinants. However, the former has a greater influence on BMD than the latter. This observation is relatively new. Thus, this manuscript is worthwhile to publish. However, only one but important problem exists in their manuscript.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Authors recorded age, weight, height, and BMI in baseline characteristics from 210 postmenopausal women. However, years since menopause (YSM) is lack in baseline characteristics in their manuscript. In such a this study, besides the age, years since menopause (YSM) is a very important parameter, because YSM is a determinant of BMD, fat mass, and lean mass. Therefore, YSM must be included in baseline characteristics, univariate analysis, and multiple linear regression analysis.

Minor Essential Revisions

None

Discretionary Revisions

None

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.