Reviewer's report

Title: On the contributions of lean mass and fat mass to bone mineral density: A study in postmenopausal women

Version: 1 Date: 30 December 2009

Reviewer: Toivo Jurimae

Reviewer's report:

As the authors of the study mentioned there are conflicting results about the relationships between bone mineral density and lean body mass or fat mass. Still now Viетnamese postmenopausal females have not yet been studied. More than 200 females studied. Additionally lean mass index and fat mass index were calculated. Who is the author for these indexes (References is needed).

Authors concluded that both lean and fat mass is needed for good bone mineral density and as a rule females with higher fat mass have greater bone mineral density. The conclusion that only lean body mass is related with physical activity level is very speculative. As a rule, physical activity programmes with nutrition control are frequently used for decreasing fat mass in overweight and obese subjects. On the other side physical activity, especially weight exercises increased lean body mass. Are there any data available about the physical activity level of the females.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'