Reviewer's report

Title: Two-year changes in quality of life in elderly patients with low-energy hip fractures. A prospective case-control study

Version: 1 Date: 26 May 2010

Reviewer: Ian Cameron

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1. The case control methodology is not the preferred method of investigation of the topic. Ideally a cohort study should be used. The authors should discuss this.

2. Participants and controls in the study are younger and appear less disabled that is typical of people with hip fracture. This should be discussed in more detail.

3. The actual SF36 Physical Component and Mental Component scores should be added to the results and the abstract.

4. That there are 10 deaths over 2 years in the cases and nil in the controls suggests that there is probably residual confounding due to differences in general health status between cases and controls. The authors should discuss this or state that they believe this mortality is due to the hip fracture.

5. The flow chart should show cases and controls separately.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.