Reviewer's report

Title: Analysis of Meniscal Degeneration and Meniscal Gene Expression

Version: 1 Date: 13 October 2009

Reviewer: Najmuddin Gunja

Reviewer's report:

When assessing the work, please consider the following points:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined? YES
2. Are the methods appropriate and well described? YES
3. Are the data sound? YES
4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition? YES
5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data? YES
6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated? YES
7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished? YES
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found? YES
9. Is the writing acceptable? YES

REPORT TEMPLATE
-----------------

Confidential comments to editors
---------------------------------

Based on your assessment of the validity of the manuscript, what do you advise should be the next step?

- Accept without revision

Level of interest
------------------

- An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English
--------------------------
- Acceptable

Statistical review

------------------

-- No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests

-----------------------------

I declare that I have no competing interests’