Reviewer's report

Title: Dual mobility cup reduces dislocation rate after arthroplasty for femoral neck fracture

Version: 2 Date: 22 June 2010

Reviewer: Clifford W Colwell

Reviewer's report:

Although the authors have acknowledged the potential weakness in the fact the highest dislocation rate was due in great part if not all to the differences in head size from 28mm to 32mm which has also been verified in multiple other studies, the authors go on to say that surgeons may not be willing to increase their head size to 32mm or above because the increase may lead to increase in poly wear and lysis. With the results now being reported with the use of highly-crossed polyethylene, I think that this response is unsupported and I'm unaware of anyone who has not gone to 32mm head size and above unless the surgeon is faced with an extremely small acetabulum. The modest conclusion that the authors could support is that the Dual mobility cup has a very low dislocation rate. They would not be able to support the conclusion that the Dual mobility cup offers a dislocation rate lower than conventional cemented THR except in those implanted with 28mm heads utilizing the same surgical approach.