Reviewer's report

Title: Dual mobility cup reduces dislocation rate after arthroplasty for femoral neck fracture

Version: 1 Date: 27 February 2010

Reviewer: Clifford W Colwell

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript could be published with certain modifications:

1) Major Compulsory Revisions. Although there is a statistical difference in the two cohorts, the major differences were within the 28mm head size group and were not statistically different if the Dual mobility cup was compared to the 31 patients with 32mm cups in which there were only two dislocations. There have been many studies that have shown that increasing head size decreases dislocation rates and that might well be a conclusion of this paper. The authors need to address this issue as a weakness in their paper. The fact that they had no patients in the conventional group with 36mm heads and above is another weakness in which the dislocation rate may be 0 in this group as well.

2) Major Compulsory Revisions The authors make an excellent case concerning cost savings using the Dual mobility cup vs. the conventional cemented implant if the dislocation rate is considered for the 28mm head size. The argument reverses itself if one considers that 32mm cup size. They need to make this clear in the manuscript.

3) Major Compulsory Revisions Since the authors had no dislocations in the Dual mobility cups using the posterior approach and since their series did not have a comparator using another approach, based on this paper they can say nothing as to one approach vs. another.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'