Reviewer’s report

Title: Association between Expression of the Bone morphogenetic proteins 2 and 7 in the repair of circumscribed cartilage lesions with clinical outcome

Version: 2 Date: 1 June 2010

Reviewer: marie paule defresne

Reviewer’s report:

Discretionary revisions

The purpose of this paper was to determine if the BMP-2 and BMP-7 profiles in synovial lavage fluids correlate with the clinically assessed knee function and if these parameters might be used as pronostic factors.

In vitro, there is strong evidence in the literature that BMP-7 plays a role in cartilage repair, but the authors do not find a correlation between this cytokine and the clinical parameters. They explain that by the fact that only patients with circumscribed lesions were included in this study.

BMP-2 is the only cytokine which correlated with the degree of clinical improvement. The difference is statistically significant for the evaluation with the IKDC and Lysholm Scores, but not significant for the other scores used. The paper would be improved by a short discussion about these scores.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests