Reviewer’s report

Title: How reliable is MRI in diagnosing cartilaginous lesions in patients with first and recurrent lateral patellar dislocations?

Version: 2 Date: 2 June 2010

Reviewer: Caroline Hing

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for revising your manuscript. It is quite difficult to read with the corrections.

My queries are satisfied but I would suggest that the authors are careful to distinguish a first time from a recurrent patellar dislocation. Recurrent patellofemoral instability usually has an anatomical component (e.g., trochlear dysplasia).

The results could be more succinctly presented - reliability does not need an individual discussion of each observer.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests