Reviewer's report

**Title:** How reliable is MRI in diagnosing cartilaginous lesions in patients with first and recurrent lateral patellar dislocations?

**Version:** 2 **Date:** 11 June 2010

**Reviewer:** Yukiyoshi Toritsuka

**Reviewer's report:**

Minor Essential Revisions

**Summary**

Conclusions

"In comparison to -----. Nonetheless, "should be deleted because these sentences are unnecessary.

**Background**

"Based on a review of surgical studies, the frequency of LPDs-----."  
"Similarly, MRI studies demonstrate a frequency of LPDs----."  
What frequency? Re-dislocation? Chondral lesion?

Please make accurate description.

Please rewrite the importance of diagnostic performance of MRI concisely.

Background section is not well-constructed.

**Results**

2nd paragraph

"Patients with initial and---" should be "Patients with first and---"

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.