Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical and radiological outcomes after management of traumatic knee dislocation by open single stage complete reconstruction

Version: 4 Date: 23 April 2010

Reviewer: Rainer Ludtke

Reviewer's report:

I found the ms substantially improved but do not agree with the authors in one major points: the results still are superimposed by a huge multiple statistical error. The point is not that the number or "significant" results exceeds the expected number, but there indeed are lots of false positive results and nobody can say which of the "significant" results were falsely and which were correctly found.

Together with the fact, that groups were not truly homogeneous (although the authors stated the were "as homogeneous as it could be") and the comparability of outcomes among patients is questionable (see my last comment) I still find the results not reliable enough to draw any conclusion.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests