Reviewer's report

Title: Is health related quality of life associated with the risk of low-energy wrist fracture? A case control study.

Version: 1 Date: 2 February 2009

Reviewer: Lyn March

Reviewer's report:

The authors had a clear question to explore whether people with low trauma wrist fractures had poor quality of life pre-fracture. They drew on a cohort of cases from their Osteoporosis fracture prevention service and argued that the majority of wrist fractures in that community would have presented to their hospital. This seems reasonable but in the end they only got 56% of the possible fracture patients to complete the SF-36 - they do discuss this as a limitation. They chose to draw controls from the same population-base in the community. They acknowledged that they could have compared to national norms and that these were different to their control population norms.

The major limitations still remains that is was a retrospective analysis of QOL and that the risk of recall bias is very high with fracture subjects being more likely to be influenced by the events than the controls. However there is no final conclusion about QOL and it would be more interesting to follow the patients to see what happens to QOL after the fracture as well.

Minor essential: I think that the risk of this bias should be stressed further

Discretionary: and that identifying the effects of fracture on QOL may be useful for assessments of the impact of the condition and analysis of effectiveness of prevention strategies like their OP service.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests