Reviewer's report

Title: Acromioclavicular joint reconstruction with coracoacromial ligament transfer using the docking technique

Version: 1 Date: 10 June 2008

Reviewer: Robert LaPrade

Reviewer's report:

Specific Comments:

This manuscript was written to describe treatment of a CA ligament transfer to treat acromioclavicular joint injuries. Overall, I believe that it was well written with excellent followup on the treated patients. However, I do have some concerns about the authors' perceptions of their uniqueness of their study using the “docking technique”. By definition, the modified Weaver-Dunn technique is a docking technique which I believe that the majority of surgeons follow. I don’t believe that the authors should report that their series is a “unique” series using the docking technique as that is almost the current standard of care. While I believe that it would be very appropriate to publish this paper describing newer techniques with stronger sutures to hold the transferred CA ligament and the distal clavicle, I don’t believe that they have a unique technique in treating these injuries and would strongly suggest that they omit this and refer instead to further modifications of the Weaver-Dunn technique using improved suture fixation.

One other point that I have some concerns about is their description of where to place the distal clavicle after it has been fixated. One has to be concerned about placing the clavicle within 1 cm of the corocoid as in this position it could impinge on the supraspinatus muscle. I believe that it would be more appropriate for them to describe it as being collinear with the undersurface of the acromion, where it naturally occurs, rather then in an over constrained position.

I also believe that it would be useful for the authors to further describe why they have switched from PDS suture to absorbable sutures in their secondary fixation of the CC ligaments.

Overall, I believe that this is a well written manuscript and that eliminating or toning down their perceived uniqueness of the “docking technique” would make it acceptable for publication.

Robert F. LaPrade, MD, PhD
Professor, Department of Orthopaedic Surgery
University of Minnesota-TC

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests