Reviewer’s report

Title: Acromioclavicular joint reconstruction with coracoacromial ligament transfer using the docking technique

Version: 1 Date: 4 March 2008

Reviewer: In-Ho Jeon

Reviewer’s report:

This is a study on 17 patients with acute or chronic AC joint dislocation modified Weaver-Dunn procedure so called docking technique.

First, I was unable to readily ascertain from the Introduction whether and how this information was new and how it materially contributed to the literature.

They do not state whether their study design can meaningfully address that controversy.

In the materials, they included very wide range of 17 patients (heterogeneous group), which included acute, chronic cases, patients with prior surgery, or with/without palmaris longus augmentation. This is too small group of patients to withdraw their conclusion.

Explanation of limitations is required in detail in the Discussion. It seems as the design was retrospective even though I have not found this as a clear statement. If retrospective, please add to manuscript.

How could a patient have repeated Weaver-Dunn procedure? This should be addressed in detail.

Figure 1& 2 should be deleted, because this has been well described in the text book.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests