Reviewer's report

Title: Time-course of Exercise and its Association with 12-Month Bone Changes

Version: 2 Date: 30 July 2009

Reviewer: Katherine Brooke-Wavell

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript is improved by the re-analysis and other modifications, although there are still some issues that need attention.

Major compulsory revisions

1. Conclusions should be more precisely worded in both the abstract and discussion. It is the number of high acceleration impacts during 6 months of training that was associated with 12 month bone change.

2. As analyses are cross-sectional it is more precise to refer to correlates rather than predictors of bone changes.

3. Figure 1 does demonstrate the presence of outliers. Do these have a large influence on the correlation?

4. The first sentence of the discussion is too strong. This study does not demonstrate the timecourse or intensity of impact loading needed to stimulate and adaptive response. This sentence should be modified or deleted.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests