Reviewer’s report

Title: Biomechanical optimization of different fixation modes for a proximal femoral L-osteotomy

Version: 5 Date: 13 August 2009

Reviewer: Susan Renner

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for your revisions. I believe the paper is essentially ready for publication with the exception of the necessary following minor corrections:

Minor Essential Revisions:
It appears that figures 4 and 5 have been reversed. On page 10 in the paragraph starting with "A ten-hole plate fitting the bone contour ..." figure 4 is referenced as showing the 4 configurations of the osteotomies, but figure 4 shows the FEA mesh while figure 5 appears to show the osteotomies.

Similarly, figure 5 is references in the text as showing the loading configurations, which seems to be better shown in figure 4 (the FEA mesh). Either the figure order or labelling in the text has been mistakenly reversed and should be corrected or the figures need to be modified to more completely match the text.

Also in figure 4 (FEA mesh) some legend or description of what the numbers represent would be very helpful. It seems from reading the text that they represent the x, y, and z components of the loading conditions, but this would be easier to determine if included in the caption (particularly if readers look only at the figure without reading the text carefully).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.