Reviewer's report

Title: Choosing surgery: patients' preferences within a trial of treatments for anterior cruciate ligament injury. A qualitative study

Version: 2 Date: 12 May 2009

Reviewer: Lucy Salmon

Reviewer's report:

The author present a well written and structured qualitative review of the topic. This may be especially useful for those wanting to finesse the design of studies involving conservative treatment of anterior cruciate ligament injuries.

I would endorse the article for publication with minor revisions as follows:

Page 7 Paragraph 3 (Participants)
The authors state "...27 has crossed over to surgical reconstruction by the end of 2007" Instead specify the months since recruitment or injury.

Page 11 Results
The authors describe 3 main categories for the cross overs. Please more quantitatively describe what were the percentages in each group. I would recommend a Venn Diagram.

Remove subject id numbers from whole manuscript including Table 1. These are not neccessary.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests