Reviewer's report

Title: COPD related fatigue: Evaluation of factors associated with fatigue in COPD and comparison with healthy elderly subjects

Version: 1 Date: 21 July 2009

Reviewer: Mary Kapella

Reviewer's report:

General Comment:
This is an article of great interest, as the study compares fatigue in people with COPD and healthy people. There is important clarification needed, however.

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Please clarify how the 9 possible predictors were identified. It is very unclear why MRC dyspnea was not included in the regression analysis. This is especially so as there were significant differences in General, Physical Fatigue and Reduced Activity according to MRC dyspnea. Dyspnea is also a very clinically relevant variable that can respond to intervention, thus possibly impacting fatigue. Please add information such as correlation information or additional rationale for excluding it in the regression.

Minor Essential Revisions
1. On page 14 dimension is spelled incorrectly.
2. On page 14 directly before Conclusions there is discussion about the reason that logistic regression was chosen. This piece seems misplaced and might have a better fit in the Statistical Analysis section.
3. On page 16 some abbreviation definitions are capitalized and some are not.
4. Figure 2 information is repeated in Table 1. You may not need Figure 2.
5. It would be helpful to the reader to have as many of the key variable mean/SD information in Table 1 as possible. Some of the information is in the text and some is in the Table. MRC information is missing.

# Discretionary Revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.