Reviewer’s report

Title: The Queensland experience of participation in a national drug use evaluation project, Community-acquired pneumonia - towards improving outcomes nationally (CAPTION)

Version: 1 Date: 23 April 2009

Reviewer: Tobias Welte

Reviewer’s report:

CAPTION (Community Acquired Pneumonia towards improving outcomes nationally) is a national program in Australia to improve outcome of patients with CAP by implementing the national recommendations. This is a report about the experience with this implementation process in a subgroup of Emergenca Departments in Queensland.

Altogether the experience with implementation of guidelines is of interest. However, this is a preliminary report of a subgroup of hospitals only, which describes the experience with the implementation process without presenting any data about the influence of the project on outcome of CAP patients.

In my mind these data are very specific for Australia and are mainly influenced by the structure of the health care system in Australia. The experience may be different in different health care systems. This are only data from Queensland, it is at least not clear, whether the experience is comparable in between Australia.

Implementation of guidelines has to be evaluated in regard to improvement of outcome parameters in CAP patients (mortality, length of hospital stay, number of patients with treatment failure, number of patients with inapprobriate treatment, cost effectiveness). In this direction, nothing has been mentioned in the manuscript. The acceptance of implementation processes is linked to the improvement of outcome, physicians and staff is willing to invest time and money in expectation of advantages for the patient.

In conclusion, a subgroup analysis in only eight emergency departments focusing on the acceptance of the implementation process, is not of interest for chest physicians worldwide. Only the whole data set, including outcome measures may be exiting also outside of Europe.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I do not have competing interests.