Reviewer's report

Title: Post intubation tracheal stenosis: report of 31 cases and review of the literature

Version: 1 Date: 6 June 2008

Reviewer: Ahmed Soliman

Reviewer's report:

This is a nice series of patients with tracheal stenosis and I commend the authors for their good work in trying to differentiate the post-endotracheal tube stenoses from post-tracheotomy stenoses as they are indeed different.

The manuscript recognizes the major limitation of the study--namely the lack of a control group of patients without tracheal stenosis; this limits our ability to draw conclusions regarding the etiologic factors. We are, however, able to compare and contrast the two types of stenoses mentioned above, which is of value.

My questions include the following:

1. What was the diagnosis of gastroesophageal reflux based upon? symptoms, pH probe, upper GI endoscopy?
2. Was there any concurrent laryngeal stenosis-glottic or subglottic? Were those patients excluded?
3. Were patients with idiopathic tracheal stenosis also excluded?
4. Was Mitomycin-C or injectable steroids utilized as part of treatment?
5. Table 2- uses the term "percentage of tracheal stenosis" which is confusing and should be changed to "percent stenosis"
6. It should be noted that in the series by Koshkarevea and Soliman, hypertension was NOT a risk factor for laryngotracheal stenosis as stated in the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.