Reviewer’s report

Title: Hyponatremia and hospital outcomes among patients with pneumonia: a retrospective cohort study

Version: 2 Date: 4 June 2008

Reviewer: Roy L. Soiza

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript (particularly the abstract and title) now reflects more accurately the results of this study. I take the authors’ point about the dangers of over-adjustment for confounders, but I still feel the previous version of the manuscript overstated the likely contribution of hyponatremia to outcome. The present version is somewhat more balanced, though some of my previous concerns remain. I am well aware that the significance attached to the p-value of 0.05 is entirely arbitrary but I suspect it’s here to stay given the wider scientific community’s concern in avoiding Type I errors as much as is realistically possible. There are probably just as many who feel it is too lenient as too strict.

Overall, given the clinical importance of the subject matter, the changes made, and the fact this journal makes both reviewers’ and authors’ comments available to readers, I think it would now be worth publishing this paper.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'