**Reviewer’s report**

**Title:** Aerosolized Amikacin for Treatment of Pulmonary Nontuberculous Mycobacterial Infections: An Observational Case Series

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 5 January 2007

**Reviewer:** Haruaki Tomioka

**Reviewer’s report:**

General

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. The authors should cite the paper written by Sacks et al. (Clin Infect Dis, 32:44, 2001), the first original study regarding the use of adjunctive salvage therapy with inhaled aminoglycosides for treatment of patients with tuberculosis. They reported a favorable response to adjunctive aerosol therapy, particularly in tuberculosis patients with drug-susceptible isolates.

2. Patient 2, who had a cavitary lesion, could be treated with inhaled amikacin diluted in an alkaline solution as proposed by Parola and Brouqui (Clin Infect Dis, 33:1439, 2001). It is difficult for aminoglycosides to exhibit efficient activity in the acid environment of the cavities of the lung.

3. Table 1 could be revised as follows.
   1) The diagnostic methods to identify NTM species isolated from individual patients could be described. The present MAC isolates could be classified at least into M. avium, M. intracellulare, or MAC X.
   2) The authors could make more detailed descriptions on duration of therapy prior to starting aerosolized amikacin for each patient.
   3) It would be helpful for the readers to describe whether or not the MAC isolate from Patient 6 was resistant to ethambutol and rifampin.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests' below.