Reviewer's report

Title: Early onset respiratory infection in patients admitted in intensive care unit: a case-control study on risk factors, microbiological profile and effectiveness of first intention antibiotic therapy

Version: 1 Date: 2 January 2007
Reviewer: Surinder K Jindal

Reviewer's report:

1. One important issue which concerns me most is the methodology employed by the authors for analysis of the risk factors. Unfortunately, they have used univariate logistic regression analyses. This is likely to give fallacious results when a large number of variables are being analysed. Several of the causal variables are not really independent in predicting the outcome of the study. A multivariate logistic regression analysis with adjustment of several co-variables should be used to determine the significance of risk factors.

2. The other issue is related to the choice of the risk factors. It is not clear whether the risk factors which have been analysed were present before the onset of infection. At least some of the variables may actually occur because of rather than being responsible for the infection.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.