Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical presentation and predictors of outcome in patients with severe acute exacerbation of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease requiring admission to intensive care unit

Version: 2 Date: 22 July 2006

Reviewer: Surinder K Jindal

Reviewer's report:

1. General

The article is fairly appropriate especially since similar data are largely missing from most of the developing countries. Certain clarifications and modifications are however required.

2. Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Why do the authors consider that the reliable data on COPD-epidemiology from India is lacking? The recent multicentric study from India quoted by the authors was fairly large and reliable.

3. Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

Since the enrollement was done at admission, the authors should have data on 198 patients who presented to the Emergency but were not admitted in the ICU?
A comparative assessment is important to assign significance to predictors. For example, the presence of comorbid conditions or metabolic abnormalities considered as important predictors of outcome in patients with AE-COPD might be similar in other group of patients who were not included in this analysis.

It is not clear how was the outcome (besides death) defined?

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interest.