Reviewer's report

Title: Causes of death in asthma, COPD and non-respiratory hospitalized patients. A multicentric study

Version: 5 Date: 4 October 2013

Reviewer: Mark Weatherall

Reviewer's report:

The authors have responded to my comments;

Major essential revisions

The layout of Table 5 must be improved. The number of significant figures for the Odds ratio and its confidence interval should be consistent with the other tables (I think 2 decimal figures was used), the coefficient column is redundant as this is just the logarithm of the Odds ratio and the P value decimal point figures should be consistent with the other tables.

Minor essential revisions

In the statistical analysis make sure that the statement about P<0.05 and the penalized adjusted P values for multiple comparisons statement is consistent. Alternatively could just leave the final statement out. I don't think the authors have acknowledged in the discussion that their conclusions must be tempered by the large number of statistical tests carried out.

I had some typographical errors for example on page 7 ‘usin’ instead of ‘using’ and ‘signifıcıvıs’ instead of ‘significant’; I haven’t gone through the whole paper to find other examples

Discretionary revisions

Table 1 has been improved and although my personal preference is that estimates and confidence intervals are presented for comparisons (rather than for mean values of each group) and that not all three possible comparisons are presented when there are only 2 degrees of freedom are available for these comparisons; I think readers will be able to make their own judgements about the limitations of the analysis. A similar comment about presenting all three comparisons with only 2 degrees of freedom for comparisons applies to Table 2

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.