Reviewer’s report

Title: Bone Marrow-Derived Progenitor Cells in End-Stage Lung Disease Patients.

Version: 1 Date: 12 March 2013

Reviewer: Victor Ivo Peinado

Reviewer’s report:

Gilpin et al. analyzed the number of CD45 + cells Collagen-1 + fibrocytes and cells derived from bone marrow expressing Clara cell proteins (CCSP+) in patients candidates for lung transplantation. They also evaluated some mediators or cytokines in the plasma of the same patients.

Although some data from this study are potentially interesting, the style of the manuscript is very confusing. Overall this is a very long manuscript, speculative and dispersed that makes it unattractive for the reader.

The hypothesis of the study is unclear or it is not defined in the manuscript.

This study would have more value if the authors look for more evidence on the role of fibrocytes or CCSP+ cells in pulmonary fibrosis, perhaps through a post transplant monitoring of circulating cells or cytokines in plasma. I suggest reducing the number of groups used in this study, since its etiology is very different and not give meaning to the work.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'