Reviewer’s report

Title: Bone Marrow-Derived Progenitor Cells in End-Stage Lung Disease Patients.

Version: 1 Date: 4 March 2013

Reviewer: William Lawson

Reviewer’s report:

General comments: In this manuscript by Gilpin and colleagues, the authors provide a dataset in which they evaluate for the degree to which CCSP+ bone marrow progenitor cells and fibrocytes are present in the blood and bone marrow of patients with different forms of end stage lung disease undergoing lung transplant. This dataset is complimentary to and builds on their outstanding work from a few years ago that was published in JCI. This manuscript has some limitations in that it is largely descriptive, but with human samples that many times tends to be the case. That being said, however, this is a dataset that does provide important additional information to the respiratory research community.

Major compulsory revisions: The comments I raise below probably can be addressed without significant additional work.

1. It would be helpful to have flow cytometry plots, perhaps in supplemental figures, that helped determine the gating for the data shown in Figure 1E and 1F.
2. For figure 6, it is not clear why data was not presented for Control BMCs as the other three categories are shown.

Minor essential revisions:

1. Figure 6 - Please specify what the * and ** mean in the figure legend.
2. The supplemental files for Supplemental Tables 1-3 could not be viewed by this reviewer. All that came up was a black box for each. I realize that this could be a computer issue on my side.

Discretionary revisions

None

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.