Reviewer's report

Title: Major Comorbid Conditions in Asthma and Association with Asthma-related Hospitalizations and Emergency Department Admissions in Adults: Results from the German National Health Interview Survey (GEDA) 2010

Version: 2 Date: 1 April 2013

Reviewer: OLUFEMI DESALU

Reviewer's report:

General Comments:
This well written manuscript investigated the prevalence of common major comorbidities among 1,136 adults with asthma and examine their impact on asthma exacerbations requiring hospital care using data from German National Health Telephone Interview Survey (GEDA) 2010 obtained by using a highly standardized computer-assisted interview technique.

This subject matter addresses a potentially important aspect of asthma management that is still inconclusive in certain areas and the work should be of interest to both clinicians and epidemiologist.

They authors justifiably remarked that conclusions cannot to be reached regarding the cause-effect relationship(s) of comorbidity in asthma patients and that their work needs to be interpreted with caution because it is a cross sectional design.

The methods are appropriate and well described, and sufficient details provided to allow others to evaluate and/or replicate the work

The discussion appropriately highlights the study’s strengths and weaknesses and draws appropriate conclusions.

The authors concluded that GERS, AR and AERD are all common co morbidities among adults with asthma and emphasized the importance of their recognition in asthma care.

Specific comments for review:

Major comment

None

Minor comment

1. I don’t quite agree with this statement as there other comorbid conditions that are related to asthma. It should re word if the authors still want to retain the reference.
Comorbid conditions found to be commonly related to asthma in adults include allergic rhinitis (AR), gastroesophageal reflux disease (GERD), and acetylsalicylic acid (ASA) intolerance.

2. This statement: As the participation in the National Health Telephone Interview Surveys is voluntary, not arising any costs for survey participants.

This statement can be changed to - As the participation in the National Health Telephone Interview Surveys is voluntary, at no cost to the survey participants.

3. Even though the study has no medical relevance for individual survey participants (no medical research involving human subjects is being conducted) an ethics, I disagree with authors that approval is not mandatory, in addition to the approval of the Federal Commissioner for Data Protection and Freedom of Information. You should have obtain the national ethical approval.

4. The BMI categories should be written out clearly and reference should be provided.

BMI were defined as obese (BMI ≥ 30 kg/m²), overweight (25 kg/m² ≤ BMI < 30 kg/m²) and non-overweight/non-obese (BMI < 25 kg/m², including 2.6% with a BMI < 18.5 kg/m²).

5. The definition of smoker is too casual please define properly and please give a reference.

Smoking status was defined as ‘current’ (for reported daily or occasional smoking), ‘former’ and ‘never’.

6. Data analysis

What is the full meaning of PASW Statistics (version 20,) and SPSS? Inc. Chicago, IL

These are abbreviations’ the author should write out the full meaning.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.
Decision
Accept after minor essential revisions (which the authors can be trusted to make)

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
'I declare that I have no competing interests