Reviewer's report

Title: Idiopathic Pleuroparenchymal Fibroelastosis: Consideration of a Clinicopathological Entity in a Series of Japanese Patients

Version: 3 Date: 9 September 2012

Reviewer: Sara Piciucchi

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions: not required

- Minor Essential Revisions

The submitted manuscript is an interesting and well-done description of clinico-radiological and pathological features of five cases diagnosed on a Japanese series of Idiopathic Pleuroparenchymal Fibroelastosis.

The authors describe findings that are common to other series previously described in literature, particularly radiological presentation with intense pleural thickening, volume loss and architectural distortion.

1. Authors may add some information regarding each case in the section of radiological features.

2. Case 5: how do they define “cystic changes” in the right lower lobe? Did they consider honeycombing? Moreover the should add more comments on the marked ipoespansion of right hemythorax on chest X Rays, particularly they may add differential diagnosis.

3. Quality of radiological images should be improved, particularly for case 4: waht does the image in left lower lobe represent? If it must represent the normality of lower lobe, please select another slice.

4. A panel of histological findings for the cases, similar to the radiological findings may be recommended.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests