Reviewer's report

Title: Impact of singing lessons on health status in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease; a randomised controlled trial

Version: 3 Date: 16 October 2012

Reviewer: Stephen Michael Clift

Reviewer's report:

I am now satisfied that the authors have taken into account the issues I have raised in reviewing this paper. In particular, they have recognised the potential confounding of the intervention with levels of physical activity, but make the reasonable point that the participants in the control condition gave no indication that their involvement had had an impact on their sense of physical wellbeing. In addition, the issue of the study being powered to detect a difference of 10 points on the primary outcome measure, but an initial difference at baseline of 14 points not being significant, was resolved. The authors also acknowledge the merit of the point made about the size of the singing groups.

The study is clearly a small one and is accordingly limited, but it does represent a positive development on from the initial study by this group, and also provides a foundation for a further larger-scale and more definitive trial.

I am very happy to recommend publication.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests