Reviewer’s report

Title: Health Effects of the Federal Bureau of Prisons Tobacco Ban

Version: 2 Date: 8 August 2012

Reviewer: Thomas Lincoln

Reviewer’s report:

This study description is clear, well written, and can be expected to yield the information intended and described. Utilizing the prison situation to study forced tobacco abstinence is well considered, a wise utilization of a public health opportunity, and should furnish useful results for the general smoking population, as well as the correctional population specifically (which is also important from the ethical and regulatory perspective) to conduct research in this protected population. The paper goes into sufficient detail in the background and study protocol.

No major compulsory or minor essential revisions.

Discretionary Revision:

One could mention the additional ability to investigate the pulmonary features in the subgroups who were also smoking crack cocaine and marijuana, particularly given the improvements noted in pulmonary symptoms of abstinent crack cocaine users often anecdotally noted in correctional institutions.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.