Reviewer's report

Title: Diagnosis of -sine materia- respiratory insufficiency: a Neurologist's field? : Case report

Version: 5 Date: 27 May 2012

Reviewer: Annabelle Lao

Reviewer's report:

major compulsory revisions:

1. the difference between micro bubble seen during RLS and pulmonary shunting is that the hits appeared the second you inject the agitated saline , is this what you saw in your patient.
2. kindly describe the methodology done during the micro bubble test including the position , how many saline injection done and tccs waveform during valsalva plus time to first hits
3. it is better if there would be a discussion as why you think this is really a hepatopulmonary shunt? not all cardiac shunts are seen by TEE hence there are incongruence with TEE and TCD but it will depend on the time of the first micro bubble seen. it is very difficult to diagnosed hepatopulmonary shunt based on tccs alone since tccs and tcd are two different procedures and not to many micro bubble studies were done with tccs. maybe if you can put in your discussion previous studies done then it would be very helpful.

minor essential revisions:

1. kindly give reference to all definition of terms, your reference should start in your first paragraph.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

i declare i have no competing interest