Reviewer's report

Title: Diagnosis of -sine materia- respiratory insufficiency: a Neurologist's field? : Case report

Version: 5 Date: 18 April 2012

Reviewer: Afshin Borhani Haghighi

Reviewer's report:

Carbonelli et al report an interesting patient with right to left shunt due to chronic auto- immune cholangitis . The accuracy of TCD & TCCD in diagnosis of right to left shunt have been increasingly reported in medical literature . For saving word limits the respected authors can refer to previously published articles for method of saline injection such as:"Shariat A et al.Comparison of agitated saline mixed with blood to agitated saline alone in detecting right-to-left shunt during contrast-transcranial Doppler sonography examination.Acta Neurol Taiwan. 2011 Sep;20(3):182-7".Overally English style is good and quality of images is acceptable.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'