Reviewer's report

Title: Intratracheally administered titanium dioxide or carbon black nanoparticles do not aggravate elastase-induced pulmonary emphysema in rats

Version: 1 Date: 16 March 2012

Reviewer: Andreas Schmiedl

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The quantitative method used for determination of emphysema has to be described in more detail.

2. Furthermore, the used parameter "mean cord length" as well as the obtained data regarding the degree of emphysema have to be critically discussed taking into consideration the statements given to that method in the following publications:


3. The advantages and disadvantages of the used method and possible misinterpretations of the results should be questioned critically and in depth.

4. The authors should check the text of the y axis in figure A and B. NC is not defined. I think, they mean CB.

5. A better and more detailed description of the quantitative evaluation of the inflammation is preferable.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. The quality of the light microscopical pictures should be improved.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.