Reviewer's report

Title: Efficacy of Once-daily Indacaterol 75µg Relative to Alternative Bronchodilators in COPD: a study level and a patient level Network meta-analysis

Version: 1 Date: 10 March 2012

Reviewer: Fabrizio Luppi

Reviewer's report:

Based on the evidence available, Cope and colleagues showed that indacaterol 75µg is expected to be at least as efficacious as formoterol and comparable to tiotropium and salmeterol regarding FEV1. Furthermore, indacaterol 75µg shows comparable level of improvement in health-related quality of life to tiotropium, salmeterol, and formoterol, as measured by the SGRQ. The manuscript is interesting, but I think that some issues need to be better addressed

1. Indacaterol 75 µg should be compared directly with active comparator and not through an indirect comparison, using Bayesian analysis.

2. More globally the methodology utilized in this manuscript, arise doubts about the possibily of a real comparison between different trials

3. The manuscript is well written and accurately edited.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.