Reviewer's report

Title: Efficacy of Once-daily Indacaterol 75ug Relative to Alternative Bronchodilators in COPD: a study level and a patient level Network meta-analysis

Version: 1 Date: 1 March 2012

Reviewer: Luis Nannini

Reviewer's report:

- Discretionary Revisions (which are recommendations for improvement but which the author can choose to ignore)
- Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1) I found two recent and outstanding publications; but unfortunately the authors closed the search in 2010: indacaterol versus tiotroium. [ERJ Express. Published on May 26, 2011 as doi: 10.1183/09031936.00191810] Excellent review from Renard et al. Respiratory Research 2011, 12:54 http://respiratory-research.com/content/12/1/54. Novartis Pharma AG, Basel, Switzerland.

2) The former author showed that 75 mcg indacaterol dose was less effective than 150 and that the plateau occurred beyond 300 mcg.

Novartis Switzerland also had experience in network meta analysis.

- Major Compulsory Revisions (which the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1) At one Atlantic coast 75 mcg indacaterol was enough; but in Europe no. I need author’s comments. FDA was wrong or EMEA?

2) The lack of consistency regarding best dose 75-300 was not observed with the other LABA and tiotropium.

3) Discussion:

3rd page of discussion; 2nd paragraph. FEV1 was an important outcome not only due to “regulatory perspective”. It has a prognostic value and despite the current tendency to minimize its relevance in COPD, FEV1 means severity, exacerbation rate, survival, and irreversible decline natural history of COPD.

3) Since no pharmacologic intervention could modify the FEV1 decline; the authors should also focus in exacerbation rates in future reviews.

4) The authors might change the title in order to obviate the dose 75 mcg because only 2 studies against 5 with other doses were included.

5) Could it be done a comparison between indacaterol doses?
**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I do not have conflict of interest.