Reviewer's report

Title: Ventilatory and ECMO treatment of H1N1-induced severe respiratory failure: results of an Italian referral ECMO center.

Version: 5 Date: 31 October 2010

Reviewer: Ian Seppelt

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for the opportunity to review this revised manuscript. Many of the reviewers' comments have been addressed. The paper still needs some serious copy editing, including correction of typographical errors and grammar.

When I ask the question "What is new?" about this manuscript (compared to every other single centre case series being submitted for publication in the world), the one NEW message in this paper is the data on the use of lung ultrasound. I still feel this could be emphasized further, but only if other areas are DE-eminphasized, so the paper is not made any longer.

The authors acknowledge my concern that the threshold for commencing ECMO in this group may have been quite low, and used because it was available rather than because it was really required. This is reflected in the outcomes.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I am a member of the management committee of the ANZIC Influenza Investigators' group and have published on 2009/H1N1 influenza in ICU. I have reviewed many case reports on H1N1 that have been submitted for publication! I have not been specifically involved with the ANZIC ECMO group.