Reviewer’s report

Title: Association of FcgammaRIIa R131H polymorphism with idiopathic pulmonary fibrosis severity and progression

Version: 2 Date: 13 July 2010

Reviewer: MARTHA PEREZ-RODRIGUEZ

Reviewer’s report:

Major
1. Although the authors did not find any differences between blood donors control group and patients control group. It is better to keep them independent because the patients were exposed to some factors that contributed to the disease outcome.
2. The authors have to define the study design.
3. The authors need to describe the pathologies in the patients control group and the N of each pathology.
4. Could the authors explain why the frequency of RR(C/C) was 0.36 and 0.16 in HH (T/T) when ancestral allele is T?
5. The reported associations on disease progression could be related to inflammation. It is necessary to make an analysis of the SNPs with the degree of inflammation in the lung biopsies.
6. I will recommend to made a Post hoc test (Tukey test)
7. They need to improve the discussion relating the results with the pathology (i.e. FEV, FVC etc)

Minor
1. The authors need to write the complete name of ATS/ERS and BAL.
2. The authors designed a set the primers base on the published sequence of FcgRIIa. They need to include the reference of the sequence when was published and the rs.
3. In methods add the buffer concentration and the size of the PCR product.
4. How many samples were analyzed by direct sequencing?
5. The authors need to explain why the RR genotype was used as reference.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests