Reviewer's report

Title: Exhaled 8-isoprostane as a prognostic marker in sarcoidosis. A short term follow-up.

Version: 1 Date: 3 November 2009

Reviewer: Konstantinos Kostikas

Reviewer's report:

In this manuscript, Piotrowski and co-workers have evaluated the potential prognostic role of exhaled breath condensate (EBC) 8-isoprostane in patients with sarcoidosis. This is an interesting study. The manuscript is generally well-written and the data have been appropriately evaluated. My specific comments are the following:

Major compulsory revisions

1. The authors state that sarcoidosis patients were treatment-naïve for at least 12 months. How many of those patients had previously received treatment? A more proper approach would include only patients on their first COPD diagnosis, since previous treatment and remission may have influenced the results. Please clarify.

2. The aims of the study should not be presented, at least in my opinion, in a numbered form (page 4, top).

3. Relative risks should be evaluated by Cox regression analysis and 95% confidence intervals should be presented, in order to address more properly the issue of statistical significance.

4. Do the authors have any data on repeatability of EBC 8-isoprostane? This is essential in order to use a biomarker as a strong predictor of mortality.

5. Conclusions should not be presented in a numerical form (see also comment 2).

6. The fact that some of the sarcoidosis patients with spontaneous remission present high values of 8-isoprostane at V2, and especially the fact that those values are even higher than the baseline values of treated patients (V1) should be further commented.

Minor essential revisions

1. The manuscript would certainly benefit from evaluation from a native English speaker.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.