Reviewer’s report

Title: Smoking, Drinking and Body Weight after Re-employment: Does Unemployment Experience and Compensation Make a Difference?

Version: 1 Date: 4 July 2008

Reviewer: Margaret Kelaher

Reviewer’s report:

When assessing the work, please consider the following points:

1. Is the question posed by the authors well defined?
   The paper deals with the very important issue of whether unemployment compensation mitigates the adverse health sequelae of unemployment.
   In the main yes. I think the body weight data included is difficult to interpret and could probably be excluded. I think the alcohol consumption variable should consider if consumption is at harmful levels. There is also likely to be a lot of covariation between increased smoking and increased drinking. It might be worth considering where people have an increase in one or the other or an increase in both. This may help clarify the findings.

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described?
   yes

3. Are the data sound?
   yes

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
   References need work

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
   Yes. I think could be clarified further with clearer definition of variables

6. Are limitations of the work clearly stated?
   yes

7. Do the authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished?
yes
8. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
yes
9. Is the writing acceptable?
yes