Reviewer's report

Title: Identifying the Tuskegee Syphilis Study: Findings and Implications based upon Recall vs Recognition Questions

Version: 3 Date: 4 November 2009

Reviewer: Guoyu A Tao

Reviewer's report:

Minor essential revisions

In the introduction section, there were 28 citations on one sentence (see the 1st page). The authors should cite several key references rather than list all of those 28 references.

In Fig 1, the authors mentioned that there were statistically significant differences in contrasts between black and white. But, I am still not clear how they handle two categories ('questionable ID of TSS' and 'most likely ID's the TSS') in the data analysis. Do they compare each of those two categories between black and white? Or do they combine them with 'definitely ID’d the TSS' as one category and then run statistic test between white and black?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests