Reviewer's report

Title: The Cutoff Values of Visceral Fat Area and Waist Circumference for Identifying Subjects at Risk for Metabolic Syndrome in Elderly Korean: Ansan Geriatric (AGE) Cohort Study

Version: 1 Date: 11 August 2009

Reviewer: Fabrice Bonnet

Reviewer's report:

This paper investigated the relationship between visceral fat accumulation and the prevalence of metabolic syndrome in elderly Korean. This is a cross-sectional study with sound data.

This paper is interesting and showed a similar WC in both men and women with similar WC cutoff points for identifying subjects at high risk. This study highlights that the WC cutoff points for the elderly should differ from a middle aged population.

However, I have some minor concerns about this study:

1) The fact that subjects with previous history of cardiovascular disease were excluded from the analysis is a limitation of the present study. We might speculate that a substantial proportion of those with increased VFA and at higher risk of cardiovascular disease had been excluded from the study. Therefore, the findings cannot be extrapolated to those in secondary prevention. This is a limitation for determining the cutoff for VFA that could be relevant at the population level.

2) To my knowledge, the NCEP-ATP III definition (even the modified version) did not include the two hour value of the OGTT. Why did the authors include 2h glucose level above 140 mg/dL as a criteria to define MetS?

3) In the abstract, English could be improved: "the cutoff value of WC may differ" is better than "may different".

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests