Reviewer's report

Title: A case control study of differences in non-work injury and accidents among middle aged men in rural compared to urban British Columbia, Canada

Version: 1 Date: 24 April 2009

Reviewer: Mairin boland

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's comments
M Boland.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Introduction
Consistency needed in describing as ‘injuries’- non-intentional or intentional. ‘Accident’ is a less favourable a term. Motor-vehicle trauma often used to describe injury involving a vehicle.

Explain BC abbreviation.

Reference previous output from BC workers on workplace injury.

Background
In background clarify when referring to rural regions rather than saying ‘in the country’. (eg—‘in certain regions of the country’, or ‘across the country’ presumably refer to rural settings.)

Lit review
Shorten literature review on medical misadventure considerably.

Reference BCLHDB
Remove error re mental health outcome- presumably from another paper using the same dataset. Appears at top and end of section 4.2.

Important that control is defined properly then.

Clarify whether in 4.2 it was possible or not to determine where the migrating urban dweller moved to..why was this not possible?

Results
It is not clear to me whether motor vehicle trauma was definitely non-work related. Please clarify E codes used. Clarify whether all results are excluding work-related injury.

Suggest give univariate analysis results in text.

Discussion
Should be strengthened. State limitations of data and study.

Tables
Revise Table 1 as it is not workable as it stands.
Suggest state in text that drowning etc is excluded.

Table 2: suggest add in p values and also highlight (asterix) when significant.
Suggest clarify headings…eg refer to hospitalization following injury

Table 3 : as in table 2. Separate sections. Use asterisks .

Minor Essential Revisions
Need consistent referencing style- eg see variation at end of first para in Methods.
Last line page 1- ? non-health accident… revise this.

Discretionary Revisions

General comment
Paper essentially compares motor vehicle trauma and non-intentional injuries in urban and rural settings. Re-consider title to reflect actual study as involved motor vehicle trauma also.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests’